

An Indebted

Betsy Huete

I. Introduction

- Pity the poor art student.¹ In the age of speculative capitalism,² things are pretty grim.³ The romantic narrative in which artists of all stripes disassociate from their classes of origin:⁴ the glamorous outcasts.⁵
- One is born owing.⁶
- When we speak about student loan debt today,⁷ and when flexibility is desirable,⁸ the initiative thus faces the risk of promising outcomes (related to its multiple objectives) that it cannot deliver by itself.⁹

The review makes four recommendations:¹⁰

- let's go gentle on one-another.¹¹
- reliance on students as revenue streams¹²
- a groundbreaking and utopian model that remains relevant today¹³
- and continued promise of art school.¹⁴

¹ Ho, Erica. "Study: Art School Graduates Rack Up the Most Debt." *Time Magazine*. February 21, 2013. <http://newsfeed.time.com/2013/02/21/study-art-school-graduates-rack-up-the-most-debt/>

² Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

³ Martinez, Alanna. "For-Profit Arts School Doles Out More Debt Than Degrees." *The Observer*. August 20, 2015. <http://observer.com/2015/08/for-profit-arts-school-in-san-francisco-under-fire/>

⁴ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁵ Ibid

⁶ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁷ Ibid

⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OED Review of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁹ Ibid

¹⁰ Ibid

¹¹ Boucher, Brian. "Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?" *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

¹² Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹³ Ibid

¹⁴ Ibid

If both the inflows¹⁵ were active and highly visible,¹⁶ a commentator,¹⁷ calling it the “single most dynamic source” of the enterprise system,¹⁸ describes a project that we would not want to participate in.¹⁹

- The response to her words surprised her in the form of notes and emails,²⁰ (what we now know as think tanks).²¹

Legitimizing process that helped make the initiative a reality.²²

The economic model behind these projections needs to be made explicit, and the economic forecasts that are the basis of projections should become more realistic.²³

A key risk factor²⁴ funded by Disney²⁵ is a wonderful, beautiful, fulfilling pursuit.²⁶ Atop the downward pull of a sinking economy,²⁷ networks of affinity stitched together²⁸

¹⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁶ Rosler, Martha. “School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists.” *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

¹⁷ Ibid

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ Fischer, Noah and Pietrobono, Kenneth. “Debt Fair is All About the Art and Here’s Why.” *Glasstire*. October 26, 2015. <http://glasstire.com/2015/10/26/debtfair-is-all-about-art-and-heres-why/>

²⁰ Vartanian, Hrag. “Accounting for Artists Debt.” *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

²¹ Rosler, Martha. “School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists.” *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

²² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²³ Ibid

²⁴ Ibid

²⁵ Popp, Nancy. “Dismantling Art School.” *The Artist as Debtor*. June 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/dismantling-art-school/>

²⁶ Bradley, Noah. “Don’t Go to Art School.” *I.M.H.O.* June 26, 2013. <https://medium.com/i-m-h-o/dont-go-to-art-school-138c5efd45e9#ei9kqi2go>

²⁷ Rosler, Martha. “School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists.” *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

²⁸ Ibid

something poetic and liberatory.²⁹ We're interested in³⁰ a particularly US obsession with solution-oriented thinking,³¹ a difficult subject, one that cuts³² you rich.³³

But my student years were³⁴ under 25 years of age,³⁵ a time of great social upheaval.³⁶ To address the campus origin of this hostility³⁷...it is too early...³⁸ to better capture the potential effects of volatility,³⁹ especially in the absence of adequate grants.⁴⁰

Although I was able to afford this big bottle of generic aspirin,⁴¹ the liberal arts and humanities are besieged across the board,⁴² and reliance on students as revenue streams⁴³ technocratic crusaders of⁴⁴ growth implosions,⁴⁵

processed⁴⁶ on recycled paper⁴⁷

²⁹ Ibid

³⁰ Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

³¹ Ibid

³² Ibid

³³ Ibid

³⁴ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

³⁵ Ibid

³⁶ Ibid

³⁷ Ibid

³⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁹ Ibid

⁴⁰ Ibid

⁴¹ Boucher, Brian. "Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?" *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

⁴² Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁴³ Ibid

⁴⁴ Ibid

⁴⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁶ Ibid

⁴⁷ Ibid

Administrations are resisting faculty efforts,⁴⁸ manufacturing⁴⁹ the downward pull of a sinking economy,⁵⁰ a floating world of shared semi-tribal hardships, breakthroughs, revelations, and understandings.⁵¹

It's a difficult subject, one that cuts to the heart of the art world's mythology and the faith people place in the notion that art is above material things.⁵²

I was precariously employed for 13 years after college.⁵³ Slow and uneven learning by⁵⁴ that believed the existing situation⁵⁵ came of this intense and polarized state-to-state bargaining.⁵⁶ The focus on poverty is straightforward:⁵⁷ a choice I made to take on debt.⁵⁸ Having to pay to live in the city, having to pay the associated fees, I now have a lot of student debt, with no prospects of breaking even and no foreseeable way to reengage with my art practice.⁵⁹ Why should an education at this level be free?⁶⁰ With large and sustained inflows of external aid,⁶¹ completion points are in effect floating⁶² even more starkly on the table.⁶³

⁴⁸ Popp, Nancy. "Dismantling Art School." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/dismantling-art-school/>

⁴⁹ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁵⁰ Ibid

⁵¹ Ibid

⁵² Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

⁵³ Ibid

⁵⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OED Review of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵⁵ Ibid

⁵⁶ Ibid

⁵⁷ Ibid

⁵⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁹ Ibid

⁶⁰ Ibid

⁶¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OED Review of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁶² Ibid

⁶³ Ibid

I cannot see how to productively participate in this movement without at least an honest group effort to address these difficult questions.⁶⁴ When we speak about student loan debt today, we must acknowledge the historical inequalities,⁶⁵ the lack of focus on how the anticipated levels of growth are to be realized and on the prioritization of actions necessary to achieve the key objectives of the strategy.⁶⁶ Art is a wonderful, beautiful, fulfilling pursuit. Don't ruin it with a mountain of debt.⁶⁷

⁶⁴ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁶⁵ Ibid

⁶⁶ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁶⁷ Bradley, Noah. "Don't Go to Art School." *I.M.H.O.* June 26, 2013. https://medium.com/i-m-h-o/dont-go-to-art-school-138c5efd45e9#_ei9kji2go

II. Dear Steve

Dear Steve⁶⁸:

To aid government elites casting about for means of containment,⁶⁹ to mourn the artistic freedom of the 1970s New York art world is to mourn a utopia in which few if any artists aspired to lives of poverty and renunciation but simply accepted them as their social share.⁷⁰ But the experience—real or imaginary⁷¹—must acknowledge the historical inequalities that persist in the way that debt and its penalties are meted out.⁷²

I think it is safe to say that for⁷³ much a cultural and moral phenomenon as it is⁷⁴ a key risk factor,⁷⁵ the objectives of the initiative have subtly evolved since its conception.⁷⁶ In response to intense pressure to make debt relief broader, faster, and deeper,⁷⁷ the liberal arts and humanities are⁷⁸ to contingent adjunct labor,⁷⁹ a choice I made.⁸⁰

A program born of extraordinary optimism,⁸¹ born of a group of teachers and students deciding that they needed to own the means of production themselves and create an institution in which there were no trustees or board of regents⁸² creates a paradox in which we can descend headfirst into debt at the expense of others, while being

⁶⁸ Rhode, Steve. "I Got an Art Certificate and Student Loans I Will Never Be Able to Afford." *The Huffington Post*. August 8, 2013. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/steve-rhode/i-got-an-art-certificate_b_3729200.html

⁶⁹ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁷⁰ Ibid

⁷¹ Ibid

⁷² Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁷³ Ibid

⁷⁴ Ibid

⁷⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁷⁶ Ibid

⁷⁷ Ibid

⁷⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁷⁹ Ibid

⁸⁰ Ibid

⁸¹ Ibid

⁸² Ibid

simultaneously unable to accept that we have created these debts and to see ourselves as debtors.⁸³

From attention and identity to privacy and time,⁸⁴ having a library is also about having bodies in a room.⁸⁵ The custodian of progress⁸⁶ without our bodies⁸⁷ are now twin objectives⁸⁸ with field visits and local consultations to assess the process followed and initial outcomes.⁸⁹

And so that wasted a year.⁹⁰

We've removed ourselves⁹¹—a defensive posture that may actually undermine us in the end.⁹²

So have we not done a good enough job, collectively, about articulating what our field is, what the values of art are?⁹³ Between 1990 and 1998,⁹⁴ possible structural breaks marking a departure from the past⁹⁵ supporting the rise of⁹⁶ propaganda aids⁹⁷ to get behind all that and look at the ideological level on which⁹⁸ cuts to the heart of the art world's mythology and the faith people place in the notion that art is above material things.⁹⁹

⁸³ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁸⁴ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁸⁵ Ibid

⁸⁶ Ibid

⁸⁷ Ibid

⁸⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁸⁹ Ibid

⁹⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁹¹ Ibid

⁹² Ibid

⁹³ Ibid

⁹⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁹⁵ Ibid

⁹⁶ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁹⁷ Ibid

⁹⁸ Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

⁹⁹

We're interested in an intergenerational conversation;¹⁰⁰ however, that number can be misleading.¹⁰¹ The assaults on education, particularly higher education¹⁰² need to better capture the potential effects of volatility.¹⁰³ It is too early to quantitatively determine whether there is a reversal in the recent declining trend.¹⁰⁴ The economic model behind these projections needs to be made explicit, and the economic forecasts that are the basis of projections should become more realistic.¹⁰⁵ The initiative thus faces the risk of promising outcomes¹⁰⁶ and continued promise of art school.¹⁰⁷

What became an experiment¹⁰⁸ sent the MFA program into free fall.¹⁰⁹ Although conceptually appealing,¹¹⁰ deficient infrastructures¹¹¹ can create disincentives for investment.¹¹² How does a large debt stock affect economic performance?¹¹³

The objective of the workshop was to obtain feedback and comments on the analysis and the main findings emerging from this review.¹¹⁴ Quantitative assessment was undertaken,¹¹⁵ provided in a simplified framework.¹¹⁶ Calling it the "single most dynamic source" of the enterprise system,¹¹⁷ the content of what it meant to be an artist was

¹⁰⁰ Ibid

¹⁰¹ Ho, Erica. "Study: Art School Graduates Rack Up the Most Debt." *Time Magazine*. February 21, 2013. <http://newsfeed.time.com/2013/02/21/study-art-school-graduates-rack-up-the-most-debt/>

¹⁰² Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

¹⁰³ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid

¹⁰⁵ Ibid

¹⁰⁶ Ibid

¹⁰⁷ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid

¹⁰⁹ Ibid

¹¹⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹¹¹ Ibid

¹¹² Ibid

¹¹³ Ibid

¹¹⁴ Ibid

¹¹⁵ Ibid

¹¹⁶ Ibid

¹¹⁷ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

completely upended.¹¹⁸ The assaults on¹¹⁹ the court¹²⁰ excludes potential topping-up costs¹²¹ and other external shocks,¹²² that they needed to own the means of production themselves and create an institution in which there were no trustees or board of regents¹²³

It allows pedagogy from a debtless standpoint.

It was not so obvious that this move¹²⁴ offshore, or simply shutting down¹²⁵ this intense and polarized¹²⁶ support for a more participatory and holistic approach to development was emerging in its own right at the time.¹²⁷ Evidence also suggests that these projections need to be¹²⁸ skeptical at first.¹²⁹ Moral suasion is the main enforcement mechanism.¹³⁰

The needed funding arrangements¹³¹ had an amazing trajectory that culminated with a truly incredible group¹³²—that’s where it fell off the cliff.¹³³

My dad is a mechanic and my mom is a bookkeeper.¹³⁴ My dad¹³⁵ gave me permission to go to art school.¹³⁶

¹¹⁸ Ibid

¹¹⁹ Ibid

¹²⁰ Ibid

¹²¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹²² Ibid

¹²³ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹²⁴ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

¹²⁵ Ibid

¹²⁶ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹²⁷ Ibid

¹²⁸ Ibid

¹²⁹ Ibid

¹³⁰ Ibid

¹³¹ Ibid

¹³² Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹³³ Ibid

¹³⁴ Ibid

¹³⁵ Ibid

¹³⁶ Ibid

Without that freedom, without being able to tell my parents essentially to fuck off, I don't know where¹³⁷ premature ejaculation¹³⁸ wasn't, in fact, a medical crisis, but a political one.¹³⁹

Don't mortgage your future. Don't count on being an art-market darling. Don't think you'll get a teaching job!¹⁴⁰ It was worse than that:¹⁴¹ a commentator¹⁴²—wonderful, beautiful,¹⁴³ unshakeable conviction we all had that a great and heartless robbery had taken place.¹⁴⁴

But the legitimizing process that helped make the initiative a reality has also expanded its objectives.¹⁴⁵ Fifth-dimension grants¹⁴⁶ know what this world can do¹⁴⁷ true and false promises.¹⁴⁸

One of the things that we're broaching implicitly is the shift from going to art school for going-to-art-school's sake, and going to art school in a landscape in which the roles of the artist and the curator and the whole situation of the "art world" have become demonstrably professionalized.¹⁴⁹

True and False Promises.¹⁵⁰

¹³⁷ Ibid

¹³⁸ Ibid

¹³⁹ Ibid

¹⁴⁰ Knudson, Rainey. "Debtfair: It's Not About the Art." *Glasstire*. October 24, 2015. <http://glasstire.com/2015/10/24/debtfair-its-not-about-the-art/#comment-825204>

¹⁴¹ Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

¹⁴² Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

¹⁴³ Bradley, Noah. "Don't Go to Art School." *I.M.H.O.* June 26, 2013. <https://medium.com/i-m-h-o/dont-go-to-art-school-138c5efd45e9#e9kgj2go>

¹⁴⁴ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

¹⁴⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid

¹⁴⁷ Boucher, Brian. "Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?" *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

¹⁴⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁴⁹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹⁵⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

But we still wanted¹⁵¹ younger people.¹⁵² But we also wanted¹⁵³ the value of what we are offering.¹⁵⁴

Right?¹⁵⁵

Adjunct and contingent;¹⁵⁶ selling, and defending¹⁵⁷ transparency, and accountability:¹⁵⁸ the processes in the sovereign debt regime.¹⁵⁹

Debt relief is a limited instrument;¹⁶⁰ ferociously underpaid and similarly precarious.¹⁶¹ The romantic narrative in which artists¹⁶² mourn a utopia,¹⁶³ carries different histories, opportunities and consequences.¹⁶⁴ At first the voices were disjointed¹⁶⁵

We owe the descendants of slaves, and we owe the indigenous of this land.¹⁶⁶ When a draft working paper prepared by the group was leaked to the press in 1995,¹⁶⁷ other

¹⁵¹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹⁵² Ibid

¹⁵³ Ibid

¹⁵⁴ Ibid

¹⁵⁵ Ibid

¹⁵⁶ Ibid

¹⁵⁷ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid

¹⁵⁹ Ibid

¹⁶⁰ Ibid

¹⁶¹ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

¹⁶² Ibid

¹⁶³ Ibid

¹⁶⁴ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

¹⁶⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁶⁶ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

¹⁶⁷ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

external shocks¹⁶⁸ participated in seminars to discuss the findings of the background papers¹⁶⁹ and seemed uninterested in developing these students as teachers.¹⁷⁰

For younger people, college is a debt-producing engine before they even begin learning a profession¹⁷¹ while still maintaining autonomy.¹⁷² The same incentives and structures that then brought about the demise of the program¹⁷³ was stable, intimate, exemplary.¹⁷⁴ The net transfer into¹⁷⁵ efficiency benefits that could also be secured through reform¹⁷⁶ may have a rural dimension.¹⁷⁷

What is at stake is the value of what we are offering.¹⁷⁸

What is the value of something that can't necessarily be professionalized?¹⁷⁹

“The future of art is Mark Zuckerberg.”¹⁸⁰

True and False Promises.¹⁸¹

¹⁶⁸ Ibid

¹⁶⁹ Ibid

¹⁷⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹⁷¹ Ibid

¹⁷² Ibid

¹⁷³ Ibid

¹⁷⁴ Ibid

¹⁷⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁷⁶ Ibid

¹⁷⁷ Ibid

¹⁷⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹⁷⁹ Ibid

¹⁸⁰ Ibid

¹⁸¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

III. Expectations

Living Up to Expectations?¹⁸²

Although I was able to afford this big bottle of¹⁸³ human capital,¹⁸⁴ the process is politically manipulable.¹⁸⁵ So let's go gentle on one-another.¹⁸⁶

Are besieged¹⁸⁷ revenue streams¹⁸⁸ living up to expectations?¹⁸⁹ Getting debt relief right¹⁹⁰ may not deliver its promise¹⁹¹ to undergird debt sustainability and poverty reduction.¹⁹² The need¹⁹³ is suggestive but inconclusive.¹⁹⁴ One area of concern voiced was the lack of focus on gender issues.¹⁹⁵

Some speakers suggested¹⁹⁶ “breathing space” for increasing social expenditures¹⁹⁷—uniform delivery mechanisms¹⁹⁸ building resilience to external shocks¹⁹⁹ which were considered too cumbersome.²⁰⁰ Although conceptually appealing,²⁰¹ deficient

¹⁸² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁸³ Boucher, Brian. “Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?” *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

¹⁸⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁸⁵ Ibid

¹⁸⁶ Boucher, Brian. “Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?” *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

¹⁸⁷ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

¹⁸⁸ Ibid

¹⁸⁹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

¹⁹⁰ Ibid

¹⁹¹ Ibid

¹⁹² Ibid

¹⁹³ Ibid

¹⁹⁴ Ibid

¹⁹⁵ Ibid

¹⁹⁶ Ibid

¹⁹⁷ Ibid

¹⁹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹⁹ Ibid

²⁰⁰ Ibid

²⁰¹ Ibid

infrastructures²⁰²—all \$100,000 of it, which I may never be able to pay off—I count it not simply as the cost of a PhD, but as the cost of getting a chance at self-defined freedom, and it suddenly seems pretty cheap to me.²⁰³

One is born owing.²⁰⁴

When we speak about student loan debt today,²⁰⁵ it was not so obvious that this move was seen as a potential benefit by and for the elites²⁰⁶ atop the downward pull of²⁰⁷ offshore, or simply shutting down.²⁰⁸ We are very different types of debtors.²⁰⁹ Don't mortgage your future.²¹⁰

We're trying to flush²¹¹...what we're trying to do is to get behind all that.²¹² The court,²¹³ the assaults,²¹⁴ the glamorous outcasts:²¹⁵ what we now know²¹⁶ to accept that we have created these debts and to see ourselves as debtors.²¹⁷ By 1999²¹⁸ and when flexibility is desirable,²¹⁹ it is too early to quantitatively determine whether there is a reversal in the recent declining trend.²²⁰

²⁰² Ibid

²⁰³ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²⁰⁴ Ibid

²⁰⁵ Ibid

²⁰⁶ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

²⁰⁷ Ibid

²⁰⁸ Ibid

²⁰⁹ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²¹⁰ Knudson, Rainey. "Debtfair: It's Not About the Art." *Glasstire*. October 24, 2015. <http://glasstire.com/2015/10/24/debtfair-its-not-about-the-art/#comment-825204>

²¹¹ Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

²¹² Ibid

²¹³ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

²¹⁴ Ibid

²¹⁵ Ibid

²¹⁶ Ibid

²¹⁷ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²¹⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²¹⁹ Ibid

²²⁰ Ibid

Administrations are²²¹ the risk of promising outcomes²²² under the original framework,²²³ an excessively narrow definition of poverty²²⁴ considered too cumbersome²²⁵ to the benefits of borrowings and the accumulation of debt²²⁶ while the link to growth has been maintained²²⁷ in shaping and advancing this dimension of the global agenda.²²⁸

Outstanding debt,²²⁹ outstanding²³⁰ inflows²³¹ outstanding²³² implementation experience²³³ even more starkly on the table.²³⁴

We didn't want them to prematurely enter an art world that²³⁵ is simply too high a bar in practice, if not in rhetoric.²³⁶ We wanted to offer intellectual access, unparalleled dialogue, generous time, and serious community,²³⁷ and the question becomes, on the one hand, why is that the exception?²³⁸ Right?²³⁹

\$7.7 billion for the next three years.²⁴⁰ what is at stake is the value of what we are offering.²⁴¹

²²¹ Ibid

²²² Ibid

²²³ Ibid

²²⁴ Ibid

²²⁵ Ibid

²²⁶ Ibid

²²⁷ Ibid

²²⁸ Ibid

²²⁹ Ibid

²³⁰ Ibid

²³¹ Ibid

²³² Ibid

²³³ Ibid

²³⁴ Ibid

²³⁵ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²³⁶ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²³⁷ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²³⁸ Ibid

²³⁹ Ibid

²⁴⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁴¹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

Why now?²⁴² Why is that the exception?²⁴³ Why should an education at this level be free?²⁴⁴ Why now?²⁴⁵ Why is that the exception?²⁴⁶ What is the value of something that can't necessarily be professionalized?²⁴⁷

Why now?²⁴⁸

Why is that the exception?²⁴⁹

How do we manage under²⁵⁰ the cliff?²⁵¹ It should remind us of the need to articulate²⁵² an excessively narrow²⁵³ area of concern²⁵⁴ provided in a simplified framework.²⁵⁵ Action will be envisaged only when the debtor has shown, through a track record, ability to put to good use whatever exceptional support is provided.²⁵⁶

But the unshakeable conviction²⁵⁷ to something poetic and liberatory.²⁵⁸ was leaving the area.²⁵⁹ Their main challenge is to ensure²⁶⁰ a guarantee that the problem will not

²⁴² Ibid

²⁴³ Ibid

²⁴⁴ Ibid

²⁴⁵ Ibid

²⁴⁶ Ibid

²⁴⁷ Ibid

²⁴⁸ Ibid

²⁴⁹ Ibid

²⁵⁰ Ibid

²⁵¹ Ibid

²⁵² Ibid

²⁵³ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁵⁴ Ibid

²⁵⁵ Ibid

²⁵⁶ Ibid

²⁵⁷ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²⁵⁸ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

²⁵⁹ Ibid

²⁶⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

reemerge.²⁶¹ They need to better capture²⁶² in response to intense pressure,²⁶³ the absence of adequate²⁶⁴ reliance on students:²⁶⁵ a groundbreaking,²⁶⁶ technocratic,²⁶⁷ gentle,²⁶⁸ comprehensive,²⁶⁹ procedural,²⁷⁰ appropriate,²⁷¹ inconclusive²⁷² relief²⁷³ matrix.²⁷⁴

One area of concern²⁷⁵ got lost in the process of legitimizing, selling, and defending²⁷⁶ the current crises.²⁷⁷ What became an experiment,²⁷⁸ an alternative way of assessing the choice of indicator²⁷⁹ creates a paradox in which we can descend headfirst into debt at the expense of others.²⁸⁰

The economic model behind these projections needs to be made explicit, and the economic forecasts that are the basis of projections should become more realistic.²⁸¹ They need to better capture the potential effects²⁸² funded by Disney.²⁸³ They need to

²⁶¹ Ibid

²⁶² Ibid

²⁶³ Ibid

²⁶⁴ Ibid

²⁶⁵ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²⁶⁶ Ibid

²⁶⁷ Ibid

²⁶⁸ Boucher, Brian. "Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?" *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

²⁶⁹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁷⁰ Ibid

²⁷¹ Ibid

²⁷² Ibid

²⁷³ Ibid

²⁷⁴ Ibid

²⁷⁵ Ibid

²⁷⁶ Ibid

²⁷⁷ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²⁷⁸ Ibid

²⁷⁹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁸⁰ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²⁸¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁸² Ibid

²⁸³ Popp, Nancy. "Dismantling Art School." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/dismantling-art-school/>

better²⁸⁴ commit two years of their lives to the program.²⁸⁵ They need to better²⁸⁶ the tech and finance sloganeering of creativity.²⁸⁷ They need to better²⁸⁸ such an incredibly intimate act.²⁸⁹

I have thoughts²⁹⁰ that could have averted the whole thing.²⁹¹

Some speakers suggested that the²⁹² viability of postconflict²⁹³ is simply too high a bar in practice, if not in rhetoric.²⁹⁴ I think it is safe to say that²⁹⁵ the content of what it meant to be an artist was completely upended.²⁹⁶

I think it is safe to say that²⁹⁷ the value of artistic research needs to be defined.²⁹⁸ So I wonder what the language is²⁹⁹ without our bodies.³⁰⁰

Who knows how many ideas that 10 percent has inspired? That's the thing that's unquantifiable. That's the thing that's implicit and rarely explicit. And that's what disappears from the picture entirely when it's only looked at through metrics.³⁰¹

²⁸⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁸⁵ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²⁸⁶ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁸⁷ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²⁸⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁸⁹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²⁹⁰ Ibid

²⁹¹ Ibid

²⁹² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

²⁹³ Ibid

²⁹⁴ Ibid

²⁹⁵ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²⁹⁶ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

²⁹⁷ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

²⁹⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

²⁹⁹ Ibid

³⁰⁰ Ibid

³⁰¹ Ibid

The second case is Zambia,³⁰² including the likely distributional implications for other poor countries.³⁰³ A similar but sharper decline is observed,³⁰⁴ but not as sharply³⁰⁵ weaker policy frameworks.³⁰⁶ Manufacturing was leaving the area³⁰⁷ in the sovereign debt regime and raised development cooperation to a higher plane.³⁰⁸ The means of production themselves³⁰⁹ allows pedagogy³¹⁰ on monetary policy and economic regulation.³¹¹ Having to pay to live in the city, having to pay the associated fees, I now have a lot of student debt, with no prospects of breaking even and no foreseeable way to reengage with my art practice.³¹²

Stable, intimate, exemplary:³¹³ a choice I made to take on debt.³¹⁴ You can remain mystified by it because we're not teaching it.³¹⁵

You can remain mystified³¹⁶ and seemed uninterested in developing these³¹⁷ large and sustained inflows of external aid³¹⁸ fixated on³¹⁹ an illiterate industrialist.³²⁰

³⁰² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁰³ Ibid

³⁰⁴ Ibid

³⁰⁵ Ibid

³⁰⁶ Ibid

³⁰⁷ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

³⁰⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁰⁹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³¹⁰ Ibid

³¹¹ Ibid

³¹² Ibid

³¹³ Ibid

³¹⁴ Ibid

³¹⁵ Ibid

³¹⁶ Ibid

³¹⁷ Ibid

³¹⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³¹⁹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³²⁰ Ibid

While the link to growth has been maintained,³²¹ the context of this evolution³²² was always meant to contribute toward a broader, more comprehensive development architecture but not supplant it.³²³ The context of this evolution³²⁴ simply postponed reckoning with the³²⁵ the same incentives and structures that then brought about the demise of the program.³²⁶

An alternative way of assessing³²⁷ that findings are based on a self-assessment.³²⁸

It was not so obvious that this move was seen.³²⁹

It was not so obvious that this move was³³⁰ born owing.³³¹ The unshakeable conviction we all had that a great and heartless³³²artist was³³³ living up to expectations?³³⁴

³²¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³²² Ibid

³²³ Ibid

³²⁴ Ibid

³²⁵ Ibid

³²⁶ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³²⁷ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³²⁸ Ibid

³²⁹ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

³³⁰ Ibid

³³¹ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

³³² Ibid

³³³ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

³³⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

IV. The Institution

The institution does not actually want people!³³⁵

I'm saying people don't know³³⁶ that this is a place where you could come and think and talk and be together.³³⁷

I'm saying people don't know³³⁸ that could have averted the whole thing.³³⁹

I'm saying people don't know³⁴⁰ the custodian³⁴¹ without our bodies.³⁴²

Who knows how many ideas that 10 percent has inspired? That's the thing that's unquantifiable. That's the thing that's implicit and rarely explicit. And that's what disappears from the picture entirely when it's only looked at through metrics.³⁴³

Who knows how many ideas³⁴⁴ debt crisis countries³⁴⁵ transfer into the³⁴⁶ postponed reckoning?³⁴⁷ Who knows how many ideas³⁴⁸ between 1990 and 1998?³⁴⁹

³³⁵ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³³⁶ Ibid

³³⁷ Ibid

³³⁸ Ibid

³³⁹ Ibid

³⁴⁰ Ibid

³⁴¹ Ibid

³⁴² Ibid

³⁴³ Ibid

³⁴⁴ Ibid

³⁴⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁴⁶ Ibid

³⁴⁷ Ibid

³⁴⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³⁴⁹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

But we still wanted two years of time and space to be artists and thinkers and to be in close conversation with each other. And outside these flawed institutions, there is little material and cultural support for that.³⁵⁰

Outside these flawed institutions,³⁵¹ we didn't want them.³⁵² Outside these flawed institutions,³⁵³ the question becomes³⁵⁴ the very question that comes up in a boardroom.³⁵⁵ Roughly constant,³⁵⁶ a flat trend,³⁵⁷ the sustainability of³⁵⁸ true and false promises.³⁵⁹

Transparent dissemination³⁶⁰ reveals substantial leakage of³⁶¹ a very different history, experience and sense of indebtedness from my white and male counterpart.³⁶²

We owe³⁶³

We owe³⁶⁴

We owe³⁶⁵

We owe³⁶⁶

³⁵⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³⁵¹ Ibid

³⁵² Ibid

³⁵³ Ibid

³⁵⁴ Ibid

³⁵⁵ Ibid

³⁵⁶ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁵⁷ Ibid

³⁵⁸ Ibid

³⁵⁹ Ibid

³⁶⁰ Ibid

³⁶¹ Ibid

³⁶² Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

³⁶³ Ibid

³⁶⁴ Ibid

³⁶⁵ Ibid

³⁶⁶ Ibid

I see.³⁶⁷ Also, famously,³⁶⁸ for a number of reasons,³⁶⁹ the program was stable, intimate, exemplary—³⁷⁰ a choice I made.³⁷¹ It was a program born of extraordinary optimism,³⁷² born of a group of teachers and students deciding that they needed to own³⁷³ the MFA program into free fall,³⁷⁴ that they needed to own³⁷⁵ incredible upward mobility,³⁷⁶ to tell my parents essentially to fuck off.³⁷⁷

How do we manage under a technocratic ideology that does not support anything beyond that which leads directly to earning a degree?³⁷⁸ How do we manage³⁷⁹ the value of something that can't necessarily be professionalized?³⁸⁰

How do we manage³⁸¹ premature ejaculation?³⁸² How do we manage³⁸³ the link to growth³⁸⁴ a lways meant to contribute toward a broader, more comprehensive development architecture?³⁸⁵

³⁶⁷ Ibid

³⁶⁸ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

³⁶⁹ Ibid

³⁷⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³⁷¹ Ibid

³⁷² Ibid

³⁷³ Ibid

³⁷⁴ Ibid

³⁷⁵ Ibid

³⁷⁶ Ibid

³⁷⁷ Ibid

³⁷⁸ Ibid

³⁷⁹ Ibid

³⁸⁰ Ibid

³⁸¹ Ibid

³⁸² Ibid

³⁸³ Ibid

³⁸⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁸⁵ Ibid

How do we manage³⁸⁶ if both the inflows³⁸⁷ would remain unchanged?³⁸⁸

The downward pull of a sinking economy,³⁸⁹ would have happened in the absence.³⁹⁰ Uganda, Mali, and Bolivia successfully reached their targets³⁹¹ but deteriorated soon thereafter.³⁹² The critical need for export diversification³⁹³ allows pedagogy from³⁹⁴ activities for its report.³⁹⁵ Poverty alleviation,³⁹⁶ excluding bilateral debt forgiveness,³⁹⁷ I now have a lot of student debt, with no prospects of breaking even.³⁹⁸

Create an institution³⁹⁹ while still maintaining autonomy as a faculty.⁴⁰⁰

Create an institution⁴⁰¹ stable, intimate, exemplary.⁴⁰²

³⁸⁶ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³⁸⁷ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁸⁸ Ibid

³⁸⁹ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

³⁹⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁹¹ Ibid

³⁹² Ibid

³⁹³ Ibid

³⁹⁴ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³⁹⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

³⁹⁶ Ibid

³⁹⁷ Ibid

³⁹⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

³⁹⁹ Ibid

⁴⁰⁰ Ibid

⁴⁰¹ Ibid

⁴⁰² Ibid

You can⁴⁰³ create an institution⁴⁰⁴ without our bodies.⁴⁰⁵ Who knows how many ideas that 10 percent has inspired?⁴⁰⁶

The 1970s New York art world⁴⁰⁷ are very different types of debtors.⁴⁰⁸ The indigenous of this land,⁴⁰⁹ all \$100,000 of it,⁴¹⁰ suddenly seems pretty cheap to me.⁴¹¹ The content of what it meant⁴¹² to address these difficult questions⁴¹³ has introduced greater transparency and accountability⁴¹⁴ behind these projections,⁴¹⁵ and the economic forecasts⁴¹⁶ are resisting faculty efforts to unionize with great force, using similar union-busting tactics and language in multiple regions and schools—⁴¹⁷ a key risk factor,⁴¹⁸

⁴⁰³ Ibid

⁴⁰⁴ Ibid

⁴⁰⁵ Ibid

⁴⁰⁶ Ibid

⁴⁰⁷ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁴⁰⁸ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁴⁰⁹ Ibid

⁴¹⁰ Ibid

⁴¹¹ Ibid

⁴¹² Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁴¹³ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁴¹⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴¹⁵ Ibid

⁴¹⁶ Ibid

⁴¹⁷ Popp, Nancy. "Dismantling Art School." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/dismantling-art-school/>

⁴¹⁸ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

especially in the absence of a⁴¹⁹ language in multiple⁴²⁰ humanities⁴²¹ and reliance on⁴²² technocratic crusaders⁴²³ and continued promise “of⁴²⁴ not needed for revenue.”⁴²⁵

Having to pay to live in the city, having to pay the⁴²⁶ illiterate industrialist:⁴²⁷ the shift from going to art school for⁴²⁸ two years of their lives to⁴²⁹ the sustainability of⁴³⁰ getting debt relief right.”⁴³¹ A self-assessment⁴³² report by a group of independent experts⁴³³ may have a rural dimension.⁴³⁴ Findings are⁴³⁵processed⁴³⁶ growth implosions,⁴³⁷ possible structural breaks marking a departure from the past.⁴³⁸ The artistic freedom of the 1970s New York art world is⁴³⁹ under 25 years of age⁴⁴⁰

⁴¹⁹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴²⁰ Popp, Nancy. “Dismantling Art School.” *The Artist as Debtor*. June 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/dismantling-art-school/>

⁴²¹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁴²² Ibid

⁴²³ Ibid

⁴²⁴ Ibid

⁴²⁵ Ibid

⁴²⁶ Ibid

⁴²⁷ Ibid

⁴²⁸ Ibid

⁴²⁹ Ibid

⁴³⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴³¹ Ibid

⁴³² Ibid

⁴³³ Ibid

⁴³⁴ Ibid

⁴³⁵ Ibid

⁴³⁶ Ibid

⁴³⁷ Ibid

⁴³⁸ Ibid

⁴³⁹ Rosler, Martha. “School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists.” *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁴⁴⁰ Ibid

Propaganda aids⁴⁴¹ a one-time debt reduction.⁴⁴² The review makes four recommendations.⁴⁴³

- discuss the findings of the background papers,⁴⁴⁴
- go gentle on one-another.⁴⁴⁵
- pay to live in the city⁴⁴⁶
- and the program⁴⁴⁷ can remain mystified by it because we're not teaching it.⁴⁴⁸

A choice I made to take on debt,⁴⁴⁹

A choice I made⁴⁵⁰

A choice.⁴⁵¹

The context of this evolution is worth noting.⁴⁵²

Debt reduction may lead to efficiency benefits that could also be secured through reform⁴⁵³; the context of this evolution is worth noting.⁴⁵⁴

⁴⁴¹ Ibid

⁴⁴² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁴³ Ibid

⁴⁴⁴ Ibid

⁴⁴⁵ Boucher, Brian. "Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?" *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

⁴⁴⁶ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁴⁴⁷ Ibid

⁴⁴⁸ Ibid

⁴⁴⁹ Ibid

⁴⁵⁰ Ibid

⁴⁵¹ Ibid

⁴⁵² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁵³ Ibid

⁴⁵⁴ Ibid

For the next three years,⁴⁵⁵ those under⁴⁵⁶ a commentator⁴⁵⁷ to address the campus origin of this hostility,⁴⁵⁸ using academic freedom to attack academic freedom, implant apologists for the economic and financial elite into the faculties, pressure university administrators and boards of trustees⁴⁵⁹ on the court⁴⁶⁰ in which artists of all stripes disassociate from⁴⁶¹ the glamorous outcasts⁴⁶² to aid government elites casting about for means of containment.⁴⁶³ We were active and highly visible:⁴⁶⁴ don't ruin it.⁴⁶⁵ Debt is as much a cultural and moral phenomenon as it is a simply economic one.⁴⁶⁶

Moral suasion is the main enforcement mechanism.⁴⁶⁷ A more participatory and holistic approach to development was emerging in its own right at the time,⁴⁶⁸ as being long wish lists in need of further prioritization and costing⁴⁶⁹ the MFA program⁴⁷⁰—a group of teachers and students deciding⁴⁷¹ simply postponed reckoning with the problem.⁴⁷² The context of this⁴⁷³ is planning dissemination activities.⁴⁷⁴

⁴⁵⁵ Ibid

⁴⁵⁶ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁴⁵⁷ Ibid

⁴⁵⁸ Ibid

⁴⁵⁹ Ibid

⁴⁶⁰ Ibid

⁴⁶¹ Ibid

⁴⁶² Ibid

⁴⁶³ Ibid

⁴⁶⁴ Ibid

⁴⁶⁵ Bradley, Noah. "Don't Go to Art School." *I.M.H.O.* June 26, 2013. <https://medium.com/i-m-h-o/dont-go-to-art-school-138c5efd45e9#ei9kqi2go>

⁴⁶⁶ Enigbokan, Adeola. "We Are all Debtors, and the Debt Shall Set us Free." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 30, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/we-are-all-debtors-and-the-debt-shall-set-us-free/>

⁴⁶⁷ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁶⁸ Ibid

⁴⁶⁹ Ibid

⁴⁷⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁴⁷¹ Ibid

⁴⁷² Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁷³ Ibid

⁴⁷⁴ Ibid

We've convened today to talk about⁴⁷⁵ a program born of extraordinary optimism⁴⁷⁶ and continued promise of art school.⁴⁷⁷ Why now?⁴⁷⁸ What became⁴⁷⁹ of a group of teachers,⁴⁸⁰ relevant⁴⁸¹ crusaders of contemporary capitalism?⁴⁸² The liberal arts and humanities are besieged across the board,⁴⁸³ from attention and identity to privacy and time.⁴⁸⁴ Some speakers suggested that⁴⁸⁵ this got lost in the process of legitimizing, selling, and defending the⁴⁸⁶ "breathing space,"⁴⁸⁷ presuming that one could actually determine what it entails.⁴⁸⁸

She describes a project that we would not want to participate in.⁴⁸⁹ She describes a⁴⁹⁰ wealthy scion,⁴⁹¹ calling it the "single most dynamic source" of the enterprise system.⁴⁹²

Most strategies, as presented, are financially untenable.⁴⁹³ The debt has been acquired by vulture funds⁴⁹⁴

⁴⁷⁵ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁴⁷⁶ Ibid

⁴⁷⁷ Ibid

⁴⁷⁸ Ibid

⁴⁷⁹ Ibid

⁴⁸⁰ Ibid

⁴⁸¹ Ibid

⁴⁸² Ibid

⁴⁸³ Ibid

⁴⁸⁴ Ibid

⁴⁸⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁸⁶ Ibid

⁴⁸⁷ Ibid

⁴⁸⁸ Ibid

⁴⁸⁹ Fischer, Noah and Pietrobono, Kenneth. "Debt Fair is All About the Art and Here's Why." Glasstire. October 26, 2015. <http://glasstire.com/2015/10/26/debtfair-is-all-about-art-and-heres-why/>

⁴⁹⁰ Ibid

⁴⁹¹ Rosler, Martha. "School, Debt, and Bohemia: on the Disciplining of Artists." *The Artist as Debtor*. March 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/school-debt-bohemia-on-the-disciplining-of-artists/>

⁴⁹² Ibid

⁴⁹³ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁴⁹⁴ Ibid

vulture funds⁴⁹⁵

Proving to be quite burdensome,⁴⁹⁶ it is not possible to draw the implications of these findings.⁴⁹⁷ So I want to cut the cord and say⁴⁹⁸

How dare you raise somebody so lazy.⁴⁹⁹

⁴⁹⁵ Ibid

⁴⁹⁶ Ibid

⁴⁹⁷ Ibid

⁴⁹⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁴⁹⁹ Ibid

V. Conclusion

So I want to cut the cord and say that undergraduate school and graduate school have nothing in common, but everything to gain⁵⁰⁰ regarding the genesis of their debt problems.⁵⁰¹

Attached to this Management Response are detailed responses in the Management Action Record matrix.⁵⁰² Within a reasonable time horizon,⁵⁰³ a debt-producing engine⁵⁰⁴ of time and space to be artists and thinkers and⁵⁰⁵ we didn't want them to prematurely enter an art world that's become too eager to collect young artists.⁵⁰⁶ We wanted to open up a space unlike⁵⁰⁷/unparalleled⁵⁰⁸/unchanged:⁵⁰⁹ an alternative⁵¹⁰ alleviation that may have a rural dimension.⁵¹¹

Going to art school in a landscape in which the roles of the artist and the curator⁵¹² may lead to efficiency benefits,⁵¹³ could also be secured⁵¹⁴ in developing these students as teachers.⁵¹⁵

⁵⁰⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁰¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵⁰² Ibid

⁵⁰³ Ibid

⁵⁰⁴ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁰⁵ Ibid

⁵⁰⁶ Ibid

⁵⁰⁷ Ibid

⁵⁰⁸ Ibid

⁵⁰⁹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵¹⁰ Ibid

⁵¹¹ Ibid

⁵¹² Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵¹³ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵¹⁴ Ibid

⁵¹⁵ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

Having to pay,⁵¹⁶ having⁵¹⁷ a choice⁵¹⁸ from a debtless standpoint⁵¹⁹ was not the pedagogical model,⁵²⁰ the demise of⁵²¹ upward mobility⁵²² into free fall.⁵²³ No trustees⁵²⁴ suggested that the realism⁵²⁵ regarding the genesis of their debt problems,⁵²⁶ resulted in a debt repayment schedule much higher than planned.⁵²⁷

But one that set in play procedural problems of quality and equal treatment⁵²⁸ fixated on monetary policy and economic regulation⁵²⁹ Why should an education at this level be free?⁵³⁰

So have we not done a good enough job, collectively, about articulating what our field is, what the values of art are?⁵³¹ So have we⁵³² processed⁵³³ growth Implosions,⁵³⁴ the

⁵¹⁶ Ibid

⁵¹⁷ Ibid

⁵¹⁸ Ibid

⁵¹⁹ Ibid

⁵²⁰ Ibid

⁵²¹ Ibid

⁵²² Ibid

⁵²³ Ibid

⁵²⁴ Ibid

⁵²⁵ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵²⁶ Ibid

⁵²⁷ Ibid

⁵²⁸ Ibid

⁵²⁹ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵³⁰ Ibid

⁵³¹ Ibid

⁵³² Ibid

⁵³³ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵³⁴ Ibid

sustainability of⁵³⁵ living up to expectations?⁵³⁶ The overly ambitious expectations⁵³⁷ of art school?⁵³⁸

One of the things that we're broaching implicitly is the shift from going to art school for going-to-art-school's sake, and going to art school in a landscape in which the roles of the artist and the curator and the whole situation of the "art world" have become⁵³⁹ a broader, more comprehensive development architecture.⁵⁴⁰ These were seen as constraints to⁵⁴¹ a groundbreaking and utopian model that remains⁵⁴² one of the things that we're broaching implicitly.⁵⁴³

But we also wanted to protest publicly⁵⁴⁴ the very question that comes up in a boardroom.⁵⁴⁵ What is at stake is the value of what we are offering:⁵⁴⁶ Disney,⁵⁴⁷ Mark Zuckerberg,⁵⁴⁸ this big bottle of generic aspirin.⁵⁴⁹ What is at stake is⁵⁵⁰ the

⁵³⁵ Ibid

⁵³⁶ Ibid

⁵³⁷ Ibid

⁵³⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵³⁹ Ibid

⁵⁴⁰ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵⁴¹ Ibid

⁵⁴² Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁴³ Ibid

⁵⁴⁴ Ibid

⁵⁴⁵ Ibid

⁵⁴⁶ Ibid

⁵⁴⁷ Popp, Nancy. "Dismantling Art School." *The Artist as Debtor*. June 4, 2015. <http://artanddebt.org/dismantling-art-school/>

⁵⁴⁸ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁴⁹ Boucher, Brian. "Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?" *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

⁵⁵⁰ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. "Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union." *ArtForum*. October 2015.

sustainability of⁵⁵¹ what this world can do.⁵⁵² What is at stake is⁵⁵³ bilateral debt forgiveness,⁵⁵⁴ an alternative way of assessing the choice of indicator⁵⁵⁵—the cliff.⁵⁵⁶

Our field cannot survive without it at this point.⁵⁵⁷

Adjunct and contingent,⁵⁵⁸ student and faculty,⁵⁵⁹ my dad⁵⁶⁰ and my mom⁵⁶¹: voices in the fine arts within academia.⁵⁶² Voices in the⁵⁶³ sloganeering of creativity.⁵⁶⁴ Voices in the⁵⁶⁵ Management Action Record matrix.⁵⁶⁶

Voices⁵⁶⁷

⁵⁵¹ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵⁵² Boucher, Brian. “Why Does Art Critic Jerry Saltz Want You to Think He is Really Poor—And is it True?” *artnet news*. November 9, 2015. <https://news.artnet.com/people/jerry-saltz-is-really-poor-358976>

⁵⁵³ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁵⁴ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵⁵⁵ Ibid

⁵⁵⁶ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

⁵⁵⁷ Ibid

⁵⁵⁸ Ibid

⁵⁵⁹ Ibid

⁵⁶⁰ Ibid

⁵⁶¹ Ibid

⁵⁶² Ibid

⁵⁶³ Ibid

⁵⁶⁴ Ibid

⁵⁶⁵ Ibid

⁵⁶⁶ Gautam, Madhur. *Debt Relief for the Poorest: An OEDReview of the HIPC Initiative*. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.: 2003.

⁵⁶⁷ Essl, Mike; Molesworth, Helen; Rabinovitz, Jory; Relvas, Lee; Ross-Ho, Amanda; Stark, Frances; Steiner, A.L.; White, Charlie. “Class Dismissed: A Roundtable on Art School, USC, and Cooper Union.” *ArtForum*. October 2015.

Don't ruin it.⁵⁶⁸ Don't mortgage your future. Don't count on being an art-market darling. Don't think you'll get a teaching job⁵⁶⁹ Don't think.⁵⁷⁰

A particularly US obsession with⁵⁷¹ a difficult subject, one that cuts to the heart of the art world's mythology and the faith people place in the notion that art is above material things.⁵⁷²

Participate in⁵⁷³ art⁵⁷⁴—a wonderful, beautiful, fulfilling pursuit.⁵⁷⁵

⁵⁶⁸ Bradley, Noah. "Don't Go to Art School." *I.M.H.O.* June 26, 2013. <https://medium.com/i-m-h-o/dont-go-to-art-school-138c5efd45e9#.ei9kji2go>

⁵⁶⁹ Knudson, Rainey. "Debtfair: It's Not About the Art." *Glasstire*. October 24, 2015. <http://glasstire.com/2015/10/24/debtfair-its-not-about-the-art/#comment-825204>

⁵⁷⁰ Ibid

⁵⁷¹ Vartanian, Hrag. "Accounting for Artists Debt." *Hyperallergic*. January 22, 2015. <http://hyperallergic.com/176909/accounting-for-artists-debt/>

⁵⁷² Ibid

⁵⁷³ Fischer, Noah and Pietrobono, Kenneth. "Debt Fair is All About the Art and Here's Why." *Glasstire*. October 26, 2015. <http://glasstire.com/2015/10/26/debtfair-is-all-about-art-and-heres-why/>

⁵⁷⁴ Bradley, Noah. "Don't Go to Art School." *I.M.H.O.* June 26, 2013. <https://medium.com/i-m-h-o/dont-go-to-art-school-138c5efd45e9#.ei9kji2go>

⁵⁷⁵ Ibid

